The Church, the Councils, & Reform

The Legacy of the Fifteenth Century

Edited by Gerald Christianson, Thomas M. Izbicki, and Christopher M. Bellitto



THE CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA PRESS Washington, D.C.

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Abbreviations	xiii
INTRODUCTION / The Conciliar Tradition and Ecumenical Dialogue Gerald Christianson	1
PART I. HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES	
Introduction Thomas M. Izbicki	25
 Councils of the Catholic Reformation: A Historical Survey Nelson H. Minnich 	27
 Aeneas Sylvius Piccolomini and the Histories of the Council of Basel Emily O'Brien 	60
 The Conciliar Heritage and the Politics of Oblivion <i>Francis Oakley</i> 	82
PART II. SOURCES	
Introduction Thomas M. Izbicki	99
4. God's Divine Law: The Scriptural Founts of Conciliar Theory in Jean Gerson David Zachariah Flanagin	101
 Three Ways to Read the Constance Decree Haec sancta (1415): Francis Zabarella, Jean Gerson, and the Traditional Papal View of General Councils Michiel Decaluwe 	122
6. The Councils and the Holy Spirit: Liturgical Perspectives Natacha-Inorid Tinteroff	140

viii Contents

 From Conciliar Unity to Mystical Union: The Relationship between Nicholas of Cusa's Catholic Concordance and On Learned Ignorance Jovino Miroy 	159
PART III. CHALLENGES	
Introduction Thomas M. Izbicki	175
8. Pope Eugenius IV, the Conciliar Movement, and the Primacy of Rome <i>Morimichi Watanabe</i>	177
9. Angelo da Vallombrosa and the Pisan Schism J. H. Burns	194
10. A Conciliarist's Opposition to a Popular Marian Devotion Jesse D. Mann **Page 1.5.** Jesse D. Mann **Page 1.5.** **Pa	212
PART IV. APPLICATIONS	
Introduction ^e Thomas M. Izbicki	227
 The Electoral Systems of Nicholas of Cusa in the Catholic Concordance and Beyond Günter Hägele and Friedrich Pukelsheim 	229
12. Conciliarism at the Local Level: Florence's Clerical Corporation in the Early Fifteenth Century David S. Peterson	250
13. The Conciliar Church Giuseppe Alberigo	27:
14. Councils and Reform: Challenging Misconceptions • Christopher M. Bellitto	291
AFTERWORD / Reflections on a Half Century of Conciliar Studies Brian Tierney	313
Contributors	329
Index	333

PREFACE

One could say that this book is a *Festschrift*, but not for a person. Rather, it is a celebration of a book—a special book on a special occasion, the fiftieth anniversary of the groundbreaking and highly influential *Foundations of the Conciliar Theory* by Brian Tierney (1955).

Thus, while the topic of our volume has exceptional relevance to current issues in church and society, it has a personal significance as well. Our authors were asked to consider the contributions of the "Tierney generation" to the significant but controversial period of the reform councils that rose to prominence when the Council of Constance healed the Great Schism (1378–1417), during which the papacy was divided among two and then three obediences, and came to a climax when the Council of Trent initiated sweeping reforms within a church divided by the Reformation. The specific issue that these authors address is how the crisis of the schism and the conciliar movement that followed caused theologians, jurists, and humanists to rethink accepted concepts of church government, and to balance the need for reform with the need to preserve order in the visible institution and reaffirm its legitimacy.

Typical of those who faced this issue were two theologians who, among others, figure prominently in these pages: Nicholas of Cusa and Aeneas Sylvius Piccolomini (Pope Pius II). Both men at first embraced the Council of Basel. Cusanus even prepared (according to Tierney) that "most mature" of all conciliar theories, the *Catholic Concordance*, in which he attempted to balance consent with hierarchy and connect both of these with wide-ranging reform. Yet both Nicholas and Aeneas abandoned Basel and had to rethink concepts of church, councils, and authority, while still preserving their dedication to renewal. The essays in this volume assess the contributions of these and other figures in this