

## American Catholic Identities A Documentary History

Christopher J. Kauffman, General Editor

American Catholic Identities is a nine-volume series that makes available to the general reader, the student, and the scholar seminal documents in the history of American Catholicism. Subjects are wide-ranging and topically ordered within periods to encounter the richly textured experiences of American Catholics from the earliest years to the present day. The twenty-six editors of these volumes reveal a command of trends in historiography since the publication of John Tracy Ellis's three-volume work, *Documents of American Catholic History*. Hence the American Catholic Identities series shows developments in our understanding of social history — the significance of gender, race, regionalism, ethnicity, and spirituality, as well as Catholic thought and practice before and since the Second Vatican Council.

The series elucidates myriad meanings of the American Catholic experience by working with the marker of religious identity. It brings into relief the historical formations of religious self-understandings of a wide variety of Catholics in a society characterized by the principles of religious liberty, separation of church and state, religious pluralism, and voluntarism.

American Catholic Identities is united by such dominant factors in American history as waves of immigration, nativism, anti-Catholicism, racism, sexism, and several other social and ideological trends. Other aspects of unity are derived from American Catholic history: styles of episcopal leadership, multiple and various types of Catholic institutions, and the dynamic intellectual interaction between the United States and various national centers of Catholic thought. Woven into the themes of this documentary history are the protean meanings of what constitutes being American and Catholic in relation to the formations of religious identities.

Titles of books in the series are:

- Public Voices: Catholics in the American Context*, Steven M. Avella and Elizabeth McKeown
- The Frontiers and Catholic Identities*, Anne M. Butler, Michael E. Engh, S.J., and Thomas W. Spalding, C.F.X.
- Creative Fidelity: American Catholic Intellectual Traditions*, R. Scott Appleby, Patricia Byrne, C.S.J., and William L. Portier
- Keeping Faith: European and Asian Catholic Immigrants*, Jeffrey M. Burns, Ellen Skerrett, and Joseph M. White
- Prayer and Practice in the American Catholic Community*, Joseph P. Chinnici, O.F.M., and Angelyn Dries, O.S.F.
- Gender Identities in American Catholicism*, Paula Kane, James Kenneally, and Karen Kennelly, C.S.J.
- "Stamped with the Image of God": African-Americans as God's Image in Black*, Cyprian Davis, O.S.B., and Jamie Phelps, O.P.
- Presentel U.S. Latino Catholics from Colonial Origins to the Present*, Timothy Matovina and Gerald E. Poyo, in collaboration with Cecilia González-Andrieu, Steven P. Rodríguez, and Jaime R. Vidal
- The Crossing of Two Roads: Being Catholic and Native in the United States*, Marie Therese Archambault, O.S.F., Mark G. Thiel, and Christopher Vecsey

A workshop for the editors of these books was entirely funded by a generous grant from the Louisville Institute.

## American Catholic Identities A Documentary History

Christopher J. Kauffman, General Editor

# Creative Fidelity

## American Catholic Intellectual Traditions

R. Scott Appleby  
Patricia Byrne, C.S.J.  
William L. Portier  
Editors

ORBIS  BOOKS  
Maryknoll, New York 10545

# CONTENTS

Foreword by Christopher J. Kauffman	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
General Introduction by R. Scott Appleby	xvii

## Part 1 INTELLECTUAL LIFE

Introduction	1
1. John Ireland's Call to the Intellectual Life, 1889	5
2. John Lancaster Spalding's "Gese's Sermon," 1900	6
3. George N. Shuster on Catholic Letters in the United States, 1930	7
4. George Bull, S.J., on "Research and the Catholic Mind," 1938	9
5. John Tracy Ellis on the Dearth of Catholic Intellectuals, 1955	10
6. Joseph Clifford Fenton Responds to Ellis, 1956	14
7. Walter Ong, S.J., on Étienne Gilson and Jacques Maritain as Symbols, 1957	15
8. Thomas F. O'Dea on the Intellectual Life as Quest, 1958	16
9. John D. Donovan on Anti-Intellectualism in American Catholic Life, 1964	17
10. Michael V. Gannon on <i>Pascendi's</i> Intellectual Impact, 1971	22
11. Paul Giles on the Intellectual as Nonconformist, 1992	23
12. Philip Gleason on the Appearance of "Cultural" Catholicism, 1995	25

## Part 2 SCHOLASTICISMS AND THOMISMS

Introduction	29
13. John England on the Consolations and Limitations of Philosophy, 1832	33
14. Isaac Hecker, C.S.P., "Catholicity and the Tendencies of the Age," 1887	36
15. James H. Ryan on the Contributions of the New Scholasticism, 1926	40
16. Francis J. Connell and the Moral Application of Neo-Thomism, 1959	43

- |   |    |
|---|----|
| 17. Thomas Merton's Intellectual Conversion to Catholicism, 1948                              | 46 |
| 18. Thomas Merton on St. Thomas and the Failings of the Neo-Thomists, 1966                    | 48 |
| 19. John Courtney Murray, S.J., "The Doctrine Lives: The Eternal Return of Natural Law," 1960 | 49 |

**Part 3**  
**CATHOLIC EDUCATION**  
**IN THE UNITED STATES:**  
**FOUNDATIONS**

- |   |    |
|---|----|
| Introduction  | 55 |
| 20. John Carroll and Catholic Education, 1787-1800                                    | 58 |
| 20a. John Carroll's Plans for Georgetown Academy, 1787                                | 58 |
| 20b. A Maneuver to Secure the Education of Catholic Girls, 1792-1800                  | 60 |
| 21. Gabriel Richard's Petition to the Territorial Legislature of Michigan, 1808       | 62 |
| 22. Black Catholics of Philadelphia Seek Education for Their Children, 1817           | 64 |
| 23. Pontifical Charter for St. Mary's Seminary, Baltimore, 1822                       | 65 |
| 24. Sisters of the Visitation at Georgetown Petition Congress for Incorporation, 1828 | 67 |
| 25. Origins of St. Joseph Academy, Carondelet, Missouri, 1840                         | 73 |
| 26. Archbishop Hughes versus the Public School Society, 1841                          | 76 |
| 27. Orestes Brownson on Catholic Colleges, 1858                                       | 80 |
| 28. Petition to Leo XIII for a Polish Seminary in the United States, 1879             | 82 |
| 29. The Third Plenary Council of Baltimore on the Catholic Education of Youth, 1884   | 83 |
| 30. Preserving Faith and Culture: A Polish Catholic Newspaper, 1891                   | 90 |
| 31. Brothers of the Christian Schools: Teaching Latin in the United States, 1897      | 91 |

**Part 4**  
**CATHOLIC EDUCATION:**  
**TWENTIETH-CENTURY DEVELOPMENTS**

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| Introduction   | 95  |
| 32. New Methods for Scripture Studies in Seminaries, 1900          | 98  |
| 33. Mother Katharine Drexel and Xavier University, 1924, 1930      | 102 |
| 34. Religious Vacation Schools in the Diocese of Leavenworth, 1929 | 105 |
| 35. Teaching Theology in Catholic Colleges, 1939                   | 108 |

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 36. Sister and at Least Forty-eight Pupils, 1948                       | 111 |
| 37. The Education of Sisters, 1949                                     | 111 |
| 38. Religious of the Sacred Heart at Stanford and Berkeley, 1954       | 116 |
| 39. Are Parochial Schools the Answer? 1964                             | 117 |
| 40. Defining the Contemporary Catholic University, 1967                | 120 |
| 41. An Indian Sister Calls for Cultural Adaptation, 1972               | 124 |
| 42. Catechesis and Renewal, 1977                                       | 127 |
| 43. A Catholic Senator on Government Funding for Private Schools, 1980 | 129 |
| 44. The Catholic Identity of Colleges and Universities, 1999           | 133 |

**Part 5**  
**CHURCH AND STATE**

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| Introduction   | 137 |
| 45. John Carroll on the Pope as Spiritual Head of the Church, 1784   | 142 |
| 46. John England Addresses Congress, 1826  | 142 |
| 47. Orestes Brownson on the Political Destiny of the United States, 1865                                     | 144 |
| 48. Isaac Hecker on the Providential Relationship between Church and State in the United States, 1887        | 146 |
| 49. John Ireland on the Church as the Mother of Liberty and the United States as a Providential Nation, 1905 | 148 |
| 50. Thomas Scott Preston Invokes the Syllabus, 1891  | 150 |
| 51. Michael Williams on the Scopes Trial, 1925   | 152 |
| 52. John A. Ryan on Union of Church and State, 1928  | 153 |
| 53. Joseph Clifford Fenton Defends the "Thesis," 1950  | 155 |
| 54. John Courtney Murray on Religious Liberty and the Distinction between Church and State, 1960             | 156 |
| 55. Garry Wills on Freedom, 1964   | 159 |

**Part 6**  
**MORAL THEOLOGY AND SOCIAL THOUGHT**

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| Introduction   | 163 |
| 56. Francis Patrick Kenrick, "On Slavery," 1841                    | 167 |
| 57. John B. Hogan Pleads for the Practical in Moral Theology, 1898 | 170 |
| 58. John A. Ryan on Usury and Monopoly, 1919                       | 171 |

59. Dorothy Day on Nonviolence, 1936	173
60. John C. Ford, S.J., on "Obliteration Bombing," 1944	174
61. William F. Buckley Jr. on <i>Mater et Magistra</i> , 1961	177
62. Dr. John Rock on "the Pill," 1963	178
63. Paul Hanly Furfey on "Actor-Centered" Moral Theology, 1966	179
64. Richard McCormick, S.J., on the Preservation of Life, 1974	182
65. Germain Grisez on Personal Vocation, 1983	184
66. Michael Novak on the Limits of Capitalism, 1993	186
67. J. Bryan Hehir on the Thirtieth Anniversary of <i>Gaudium et Spes</i> , 1996	188



### Part 7 SPIRITUALITY AND ART

Introduction	191
68. On the Mission and Influence of Christian Art, 1900	194
69. Gregorian Chant as Art: Translating the Liturgy into Music, 1908	198
70. Literature as a Moral Activity, 1953	201
71. Flannery O'Connor on the Prophetic Vision of the Fiction Writer, 1969	204
72. The Impact of the Legion of Decency on American Film, 1951	206
73. A Celebrated Novelist Examines the Catholic Roots of Her Craft, 1988	209

### Part 8 THEOLOGY AND SCIENCE

Introduction	215
74. A Notre Dame Priest Explores the Possibility of "Theistic Evolution," 1896	223
75. The Struggle against Eugenics in the Early Twentieth Century, 1926	228
76. The Proper Relationship between Theology and Science, 1950	232
77. Monsignor Fulton Sheen on the Problem with Modern Psychology and Psychoanalysis, 1949	235
78. Pierre Teilhard de Chardin, S.J.: Reconceptualizing Creation, Cosmology, and Christology through the Lens of Evolution, 1964	238
79. "An Ecological Ethic Grounded in Truth": Feminism, Environmentalism, and Women's Spirituality, 1993	242

### Part 9 THE PATH TO VATICAN II

Introduction	247
80. The Founding of the <i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i> , 1939	256
81. Joseph C. Fenton on Defining "Religious Freedom," 1944	259
82. John Courtney Murray, S.J., on "the Religion of the State," 1949	262
83. The Problems with the "New Theology," 1950	267
84. The Social Implications Embodied in the Liturgy, 1951	271
85. John LaFarge, S.J., on Race Relations, 1956	273
86. Walter Ong, S.J., on History and the Catholic Mind, 1957	277
87. Gustave Weigel, S.J., on the Promise of Ecumenism, 1960	279
87a. How the Catholic Church Views Herself, 1961	280
87b. How, Then, May We Proceed with Ecumenical Dialogue? 1960	282

### Part 10 THE CONTESTED LEGACY OF VATICAN II

Introduction	285
88. Avery Dulles, S.J., on the Council's Teaching on "The Church and the World," 1967	295
89. Mary Daly and the Birth of Radical Catholic Feminism, 1968	299
90. <i>Humanae Vitae</i> and the Rise of Public Theological Dissent, 1968-69	302
91. Against the Radical Catholics, 1971	306
92. The Real Gains in Ecumenical Dialogue, 1974	309
93. David Tracy on Rethinking Theology within the Context of Pluralism, 1981	312
94. The Incomplete Progress toward Ecumenism, 1988	315
95. Andrew Sullivan on Catholicism and Homosexuality, 1997	317
Index	321